Countering Illicit Power: An Educator’s Guide

by Michelle Hughes
David Gordon
and Michael Miklaucic

A Publication of the Center for Complex Operations
“Countering Illicit Power: An Educator’s Guide” was developed on behalf of the Center for Complex Operations and the Institute for National Strategic Studies at the National Defense University for educational use by VALRAC Innovation, LLC and the Old Dominion University Research Foundation.

All materials may be quoted, used, or disseminated without permission, provided that a standard source credit line is included.

Opinions, conclusions, and recommendations expressed or implied within are solely those of the contributors and do not necessarily represent the views of the Department of Defense, or any other agency of the federal government. The Department of Defense makes no guarantees, warranties, or assurances of any kind, express or implied, with respect to such information, including any information on linked sites and including, but not limited to, accuracy of the information or its completeness, timeliness, usefulness, adequacy, continued availability, or ownership.

Foreword


The materials consist of facilitator’s guides, lecture notes, outline slides, webcasts, and podcasts designed for active, reserve, and civilian components of the Joint Force, as well as civilians in the national security enterprise. They are intended to help planners, implementers, and policy makers at all levels bridge the gap between strategy and implementation when confronting this difficult and complex challenge. The materials introduce tools, techniques and procedures for planning and implementation across a wide range of essential tasks – from interagency coordination, to intelligence preparation, to building partner capacity and security force assistance. The “Model Syllabus” has been tested for traditional classroom instruction and graduate-level professional military education; facilitated, interactive distance learning; unit-level pre-deployment training and mission rehearsal exercises; and scenario-based planning. In each instance, the materials have proven themselves to be adaptable to a wide range of missions, echelons, geographic locations, and student demographics.

Research direction and leadership for this project was provided by Michelle A. Hughes, Esq. and the Old Dominion University Research Foundation. We also gratefully acknowledge the contributions of David Gordon, Douglas Farah and IBI Consultants, CCO staff members Patricia Clough, Joey Seich, and Becky Harper, and the contributing authors to all three of the *Convergence-* and *Impunity*-related publications.

The Center for Complex Operations (CCO) was established to support the preparation of Department of Defense and other U.S. Government personnel for complex operations in such areas as training and education, and the innovation and development of new knowledge. It is our hope that the “Countering Illicit Power” courseware contributes toward fulfilling this mission.

Dr. Joseph J. Collins  
Director  
Center for Complex Operations (INSS)

Michael Miklaucic  
Director of Research/PRISM Editor  
Center for Complex Operations (INSS)
# Table of Contents

Foreword .......................................................................................................................... 3  
Introduction ...................................................................................................................... 6  
Definitions ........................................................................................................................ 7  
Courseware Structure ...................................................................................................... 8  
Learning Objectives ......................................................................................................... 8  
Learning Outcomes .......................................................................................................... 9  
JPME Requirements and Special Areas of Emphasis (SAE) ............................................ 10  
Guidelines for Learning .................................................................................................. 11  
The Test and Evaluation Process ................................................................................... 13  
Outline of the Courseware and Teaching Aids ............................................................... 14  
  Books ............................................................................................................................... 14  
  Case Studies ................................................................................................................... 15  
  Assigned Readings ......................................................................................................... 15  
  “Beyond the Book” Webcasts/Podcasts ....................................................................... 15  
  Tabletop or Small Group Exercise .............................................................................. 17  
  Facilitator’s Guides, Lecture Notes, and Thematic Papers ............................................ 17  
  e-Guide to Countering Illicit Power in Humanitarian Assistance and Disaster Relief Operations ............................................................................................................. 18  
Module 1: Introduction to Illicit Power and the Problem of Convergence – Definitions, Objectives, and Taxonomy ................................................................. 19  
Module 2: Peace Matters: The Impact of Peace Agreements and Political Accords on Illicit Power – Why is this an operational problem? .................................................... 20  
Module 3: Understanding the Operational Environment and the Intelligence Challenge ......................................................................................................................... 22  
Module 4: Capacity Building, Institutional Development, and Accountability ................ 24  
Module 5: Countering Illicit Power in Humanitarian Assistance and Disaster Relief Operations .................................................................................................................. 25  
Module 6: Planning and Prioritization ............................................................................. 26  
Module 7: Applied Learning ............................................................................................. 27  
Additional Resources ....................................................................................................... 29
Introduction

_The Joint Force is not optimized for a protracted struggle against capable and adaptive non-state adversaries, including state sponsored or directed entities._

Vice Admiral Kevin Scott

_Strategies that weaken illicit power structures and strengthen legitimate state authority are vital to national and international security._

Lieutenant General H.R. McMaster

In 2005, in response to a challenge that was identified by war fighters in Afghanistan and Iraq, the U.S. Department of Defense Joint Forces Command, together with its interagency partners in the U.S. Agency for International Development, the Departments of State, Justice, and Homeland Security, and international and non-governmental organizations, launched a substantial research and concept development effort to address an often misunderstood and misdiagnosed catalyst of de-stabilization: illicit power. Experience had shown that international interventions are directly undermined by the presence of criminal and political patronage networks, militias, insurgents, transnational criminal organizations, and other illicit groups that enrich themselves through trafficking, exploitation of national resources, and the capture of state institutions. These groups perpetuate underlying drivers of conflict and a culture of impunity. Ultimately, their presence and power precludes achievement of our national security objectives. Unless we recognize and address this complex threat as part of our collective response to conflict and instability, prospects for a sustainable peace are significantly diminished. The 2005 interagency initiative represented an opportunity to define the challenge and formulate comprehensive approaches toward a more effective national security response.

Over the next several years, the interagency effort grew as war fighters demanded innovative capabilities and solutions, and adapted to leverage emerging insights and lessons from the field. Concept development branches and sequels emerged. Related initiatives focused on developing a taxonomy for illicit power structures, a criminal justice sector assessment tool, and a

---

1 Joint Staff White Paper, _Countering Threat Networks Campaigning_ (October 18, 2016).
comprehensive approach to security sector reform, to include security sector governance. The concepts and ideas in each were field tested in more than a dozen countries, including Colombia, Afghanistan, Albania, Kenya, and Liberia, to name only a few. Subsequently, the Center for Complex Operations (CCO) began to codify the findings, together with its own research on the convergence of state failure, criminality, and conflict. CCO also built a consortium of U.S. and international experts who ultimately contributed to the publication of numerous edited volumes of material, including the three books that are the primary texts for the Countering Illicit Power courseware.

In 2015, CCO received a “Minerva” research grant from the Office of the Secretary of Defense, Undersecretary for Policy, to transform this body of work into education materials that could support Joint professional military education (JPME), and serve as a model for transitioning cutting edge social science research into policy, programs, capabilities, and education for national security professionals across the enterprise. The courseware outlined in this “Educator’s Guide,” and accessible via the CCO website, is the result.

---

**Definitions**

**Licit** -- conforming to the requirements of the law; not forbidden by law; permissible

**Illicit** -- not allowed by law; unlawful or illegal; involving activities that are not considered morally acceptable

**Illicit Power Structures** -- entities that seek political and/or economic power through the use of violence or the threat of violence, often supported by criminal economic activity. The leadership may be within or parallel to the state, or may constitute armed opposition to it. Illicit power structures operate outside the framework for establishing and maintaining the rule of law, and erode that framework.

---

Courseware Structure

The Countering Illicit Power courseware consists of modular, “plug-and-play” instructional guides and case studies, together with teaching aids such as webcasts, podcasts, and power point presentations that can be delivered through various learning platforms. When aggregated as suggested by the model syllabus, the materials stand alone as a core or elective graduate-level course that addresses the challenge of countering illicit power. Alternatively, individual modules and teaching aids can be disaggregated to supplement existing training, education, war gaming, simulations, and tabletop exercises.

It is not the intent of these materials to provide a set-piece program of instruction. When confronting the problem of illicit power, there are rarely “right” answers or solutions. Every course of action presents risks and opportunities. Helping the learning audience recognize risk, understand critical information requirements, and anticipate and plan to contain or confront illicit power is the goal. Beta testing in a number of different learning environments exposed only one, hard and fast rule for delivery -- that the most effective learning takes place through collaboration. Where robust discussion and debate was not possible, the students continued to have difficulty understanding how to apply the concepts and lessons. Thus, the version 1.0 courseware was reframed to enable robust interaction between facilitators and the learning audience.

Facilitators and professors do not have to be subject matter experts to use the materials effectively. They do, however, need to be thoroughly familiar with the content of the case studies and the enduring lessons derived from them. “Facilitator’s Guides” provide a useful organization framework, but they are not a substitute for the actual case studies themselves. Facilitators must also be comfortable guiding the learning audience through an often open-ended process of critical thinking, discussion and debate.

Learning Objectives

The learning objectives of the courseware are to help military and other U.S. government personnel:

- Understand illicit power structures -- how they are structured and how they operate, and the disruptive impact they have on our ability to achieve strategic objectives.
- Apply critical thinking and adaptive learning to conflict analysis and assessment in situations involving illicit power structures.
- Effectively identify critical information and intelligence requirements.
- Formulate strategies for effective international and inter-organizational engagement and cooperation for countering illicit power structures.
• Be aware of available means, methods, and tools for countering the effects of illicit power during active conflict and political transformation.

• Understand the planning factors involved in operations to counter illicit power structures.

**Learning Outcomes**

Upon completion of the model syllabus, students should be able to:

• Recognize the importance of illicit power and illicit power structures to security and development operations.

• Analyze illicit power structures to determine their strengths and vulnerabilities.

• Design campaigns and programs to counter illicit power and illicit power structures.

• Coordinate activities with other U.S. government agencies and international actors.

• Evaluate the effects of actions taken to counter illicit power and illicit power structures and adjust accordingly.
The problem of illicit power presents a universal security challenge that, as the case studies illustrate, is not confined to time, terrain, or culture. As LTG H. R. McMaster pointed out in his forward to Impunity: “Crafting effective strategies . . . must begin with an understanding of the factors that drive violence, weaken state authority, and strengthen illicit actors and power structures.” This is an enduring problem.

Although not specifically designed to do so, the “Countering Illicit Power” courseware does address a multiplicity of current Department of Defense requirements for both Service-specific and joint professional military education (JPME).

Special consideration was also given to the Joint Professional Military Education (JPME) Special Areas of Emphasis (SAE) List that was issued by the Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff for 2016-17. Thus, the “Countering Illicit Power” courseware addressed four of the five 2016 SAEs. There is some carryover into the SAEs for 2017-2018 as a result.

The relevant 2016 SAEs are:

SAE 1 -- Transregional, Multi-function, Multi-domain Joint Warfighting:
   a. Characteristics that define the strategic landscape and modern battlefield;
   b. Comparative perspective on defining the enduring nature of war vice changing character of conflict; and
   c. Ability to address warfare in the seams, to include economic, information, and gray zone competition;

SAE 3 -- Counter/Anti-Corruption;

SAE 4 -- Leveraging Security Force Assistance (SFA) Principles to Build Partner Security Capacity; and

SAE 5 -- Operational Assessment [Contributes to all objectives, guides strategic questions, opportunities, risks, and indicators of performance, effectiveness, and success].  

---

6 The Joint Staff – 2016 JPME Special Areas of Emphasis List.
Guidelines for Learning

The courseware is intended to use the concepts of military education that have been developed by DOD and the military services. It supports a continuous, adaptive learning model to develop creative, and critical thinking, encourage initiative, promote teamwork, and stress accountability. The courseware enables context-based, collaborative, problem-centered instruction. The process is intended to be learner-centric, and should be part of a career-long continuum. In order to make the materials available at the learner’s point of need, the materials are packaged in short modules to support related distributed learning.

The courseware can also support blended learning – combining technological delivery of basic concepts with live group problem-solving. Above all, the instruction uses outcome-oriented instructional strategies to provide operationally relevant content. When using these materials, the instructor should facilitate, rather than merely dispensing facts – no "sage on the stage." The courseware should promote “effortful study” and “deliberate practice,” by progressively challenging the learner with more difficult problems. And finally, the materials should make it possible to have appropriate measures of what the learner has in fact learned.

OODA

“The explosion of information technologies that provides global and regional actors nearly instant access to information means that the United States no longer enjoys clear operational and technological advantages in the competition to "observe, orient, decide and act more effectively than adversaries.” — GEN Martin Dempsey, Ret. CJCS

The courseware is not intended to be an abstract, purely theoretical examination of illicit power structures as discussed in Impunity. While theory is important, it must be made applicable and actionable in the context of achieving military objectives. As Boyd explicated in his theory of the OODA Loop (Observe-Orient-Decide-Act), the competitor who is able to process information and make decisions and take action more quickly than the adversary will usually outperform and defeat the adversary. The goal of the courseware is to allow the learner to rapidly and effectively orient upon the observations made in an operational problem involving illicit power structures, thus allowing the learner to make effective decisions more rapidly and to take decisive actions to contain, control, co-opt, or destroy the illicit power structure.

7 CJCSI 1800.01D, Officer Professional Military Education Policy (OPMEP) (cur. 5 Sep 12); Joint Education White Paper (16 July 2012); TRADOC Pam 525-8-2, The Army Learning Concept 2015 (20 Jan 2011).
The orientation process involves interpreting a mass of observational data in order to produce information that can be used in decision-making. Determining what data are relevant is the biggest challenge, and often can be excessively time consuming, which can be fatal if the adversary is able to Observe, Orient, Decide and Act while you are still attempting to understand the data. One great benefit of applying social science research and analysis methodologies to the problems posed by illicit power structures is that such tools allow the construction of analytical frameworks that allow the data to be more rapidly evaluated and correctly understood.

In this context, the term "framework" is used to mean a set of concepts that allow data to be ordered and evaluated; it is a tool that supports critical thinking, and allows more rapid orientation, decision-making, and action. A framework is not a checklist of things to do, but a structure of ideas that allow data to be understood properly. A useful framework allows us to ask the right questions to find the relevant answers. A framework should allow us to abstract from the data those things which are meaningful to our problem-solving without including the irrelevant and without excluding the essential. A framework must be constantly reviewed to ensure fidelity of abstraction. Frameworks should never be set in stone; they should be subjected to ongoing critique, modification, and replacement when needed. The Countering Illicit Power courseware is specifically designed to introduce conceptual, evidence-based frameworks that can universally applied.
The Test and Evaluation Process

Throughout its development, the Countering Illicit Power courseware was tested on a variety of training audiences. The model curriculum was designed to support a combination online and residence program at the graduate level taught by the Naval Postgraduate School. Students were given reading and listening assignments in advance. Their independent study was then supported by eight hours of classroom instruction and facilitated discussion, reinforced by small group projects based on Impunity case studies that were not covered in the classroom. The group project required students to retrospectively apply the principles and frameworks they had learned to the real world, historical examples. They were graded on oral presentations and written analysis.

The materials were repackaged in a seminar format for regional National Guard units assigned to a counterdrug mission. The purpose was to improve understanding of the intersection between strategy, policy, and the tactical mission those units were implementing at the time. The focus was on strengthening analytic understanding of targeted networks, the networks’ enabling environment, and the Guard’s ability to more effectively collaborate with its interagency partners.

A third variation was developed for the Reserve Component. In this test, a civil affairs battalion participated in 20 hours of iterative training during weekend drills over a period of several months. Using one, “model syllabus” module at a time, students were gradually introduced to the enduring insights. On-site facilitation enabled them to digest the case studies and apply their lessons to a number of different real-world missions the unit was performing throughout the Middle East. Podcasts and reading assignments prepared participants for distributed learning over a variety of different communications platforms to accommodate individuals who were engaged in train, advise, and assist missions. The webcasts created further opportunities to add depth to their understanding. The test unit concluded that the value of the courseware was indisputable, and is looking to institutionalize the curriculum into an intensive active-duty-for-training (ADT) program at both Brigade and Battalion level.

Finally, outside of DOD, the materials were used as the core components of graduate and post-graduate courses and seminars for international rule of law and governance development professionals. In these experiments, the courseware was supplemented by other research to add academic rigor. The Countering Illicit Power courseware proved to be some of the most effective implementer-focused material, adding an operational perspective not normally seen in this type of program. The international students, most of whom were practicing professionals in their home countries or international organizations, and representing more than 30 countries, also affirmed the validity and relevance of the insights and lessons presented in Impunity and Convergence.

In all instances, participant audiences praised the content of the courseware for its operational focus. In pre- and post-learning assessments, students rated themselves as having increased their knowledge and understanding of illicit power by 1.5 – 3.0 points on a scale of five, depending on the module and their prior experience. In no case was the post-assessment “endpoint” ever lower than four. Demand for further training rapidly outstripped the project team’s ability to support.
Outline of the Courseware and Teaching Aids

The Courseware is organized into seven modules. Each module consists of an orientation to the subject, usually in the form of facilitator’s guides and/or lecture notes, together with edit-capable power point slides. Components include:

Books. The primary texts are the three edited volumes on the topic of illicit networks assembled and published by NDU/CCO between 2013 and 2016.

   http://cco.ndu.edu/Publications/Books/Impunity.aspx

   Impunity forms the basis for the model syllabus because it was specifically written as a textbook for policy makers, planners, and implementers who must address the problem of countering illicit power structures during conflict, stabilization, and political transition. It consolidates lessons from five decades and more than 36 case studies including Iraq, Afghanistan, Liberia, Sierra Leone, Philippines, Sri Lanka, Colombia, Haiti, Russia, Ukraine, Liberia, Timor Leste, and following money and weapons around the world. It introduces readers to a range of tools, processes, and methods for dealing with illicit power, from an operational perspective.

   http://cco.ndu.edu/Portals/96/Documents/books/convergence/convergence.pdf

   Convergence is an edited volume that delves deeply into the emerging global threat from illicit networks with an impressive cadre of authors who illuminate the important aspects of transnational crime and other illicit networks. The book describes the clear and present danger and the magnitude of the challenge of converging and connecting illicit networks; the ways and means used by transnational criminal networks and how illicit networks operate and interact; how the proliferation, convergence, and horizontal diversification of illicit networks challenge state sovereignty; and how different national and international organizations are fighting back. Convergence is designed to facilitate a deeper understanding of the problem that will allow us to then develop a more comprehensive, more effective, and more enduring solution.

   http://cco.ndu.edu/BCWWO/

   Beyond Convergence is a follow-on collection of essays to Convergence: Illicit Networks and National Security in the Age of Globalization. Since then, events around the world have evolved, confirming the threat posed against world order. A range of new actors and emerging dynamics
have rapidly evolved with in the global operating environment. Beyond Convergence begins mapping these new actors and dynamics, providing evidence of collaboration, collusion, and coordination among diverse networked nonstate adversaries. Illicit networks, including terrorists, insurgents, and transnational criminal organizations, pose an existential threat to many states, and cumulatively to the rule of law-based global system of states.

**Case Studies.** The case study is a central element of the courseware, and is based upon the materials in the book, Impunity. Selected case studies have been summarized in Facilitator’s Guides that include a summary, discussion questions, and suggestions for further reading for the instructor, the students, or both.

**Assigned Readings.** Each module includes suggested chapter materials from Convergence, Impunity, and Beyond Convergence that will enhance students’ understanding and prepare them to fully participate in facilitated discussions.

**“Beyond the Book” Webcasts/Podcasts.** Webcasts and podcasts were produced specifically to enable instructors and facilitators to go beyond the books, adding insights, updates, and analysis that for various reasons, the authors and editors were unable to include in the books at the time they were written. “Beyond the Book” productions are generally short (7-15 minutes). They have also been edited to enable facilitators to choose short 1-3-minute sound bites that make key points while letting the learning audience hear directly from the experts themselves. A complete listing of the webcasts and podcasts includes:

1. **Webcast: “Convergence, Beyond Convergence, and the Challenge of Impunity” featuring Michael Miklaucic**

   In this short webcast, author, editor, and political scientist Michael Miklaucic, aided by contributors to Impunity and Beyond Convergence, defines the problem posed by illicit actors and their impact on the future of our national security and the risks to state sovereignty and international order.

2. **Podcast: “Impunity: Countering Illicit Power in War and Transition – A Conversation with the Authors”**

   This two-part podcast is an edited version of the book launch for Impunity, hosted by the Woodrow Wilson Center for International Scholars in 2017. It features eight of the contributing authors, who discuss a range of issues including how criminal patronage networks arise, the destabilizing effects of unchecked, transnational organized crime and corruption, and the opportunities and challenges for policing in a civil-military environment. This podcast has been specially edited for use as a “listen ahead” assignment.

Using Latin America as a regional case study, veteran journalist Douglas Farah presents his analysis, based on more than three decades of investigation, into the convergence of insurgency, extremism, corruption, and transnational organized crime. His detailed narrative provides a comprehensive overview of the phenomena described in *Convergence, Impunity, and Beyond Convergence*. This 30-minute webcast is an excellent scene-setter for deeper study into the totality of the issues explored in all three publications.


This short webcast by rule of law and security sector reform expert Michelle Hughes, provides an overview of the importance of peace agreements and settlements to efforts to contain illicit power in the aftermath of conflict and political transition. Contributing authors highlight key issues, while Hughes provides a roadmap for analysis and comparison using case studies from Afghanistan, Sierra Leone, and Colombia, as well as contextual consideration of the conflicts in the Philippines and Sri Lanka.


In this short webcast, David Johnson, the Executive Director of C4ADS, a Washington, DC-based think tank that specializes in network analysis, discusses the lessons that C4ADS learned during its process of unraveling the Odessa Network, a Russian-controlled arms trafficking enterprise. He explains C4ADS’s open source methodology, and further outlines how the C4ADS team has subsequently applied its techniques to other illicit activities including wildlife trafficking and the proliferation of hate speech.


Investigative reporter and best-selling author Gretchen Peters shares her insights into the means and methods used by illicit power structures, and in particular, the activities that exemplify illicit economic activity. She further describes the processes she uses to understand the operational environment, and offers suggestions on how to address the information-gathering challenge.

7. Webcast: “Radicalization, Social Media, and Gender” featuring Maeghin Alarid

In a fascinating narrative, researcher Maeghin Alarid explores the phenomenon of online recruitment and radicalization, from the perspective of the Islamic State’s use of social media to recruit women and sustain its extremist vision of a new Caliphate. Alarid’s cutting edge research adds additional perspective to ongoing discussions and debate.

8. Podcast: “The Challenge of Countering Impunity in International Missions” featuring
Mark Kroeker and David Beer

Former Portland Police Chief Mark Kroeker, and retired RCMP Superintendent David Beer have a combined total of more than eight decades as law enforcement leaders both within their home countries and internationally, directing United Nations missions abroad. In this podcast, they discuss lessons and insights from international missions, focusing primarily on the coordination challenge for military, police, and host nation officials.


Together with international policing experts Mark Kroeker and David Beer, security sector reform expert Michelle Hughes discusses the unique challenge of effective policing development. Using several real-world examples, Hughes, Kroeker, and Beer provide guiding principles for program design and a roadmap for creating policing accountability within the rule of law.


In this thought-provoking interview, National Defense University Professor Tom Marks analyzes insurgencies in Sri Lanka and Colombia to illustrate the difficulty in determining what “success” looks like when confronting the problem of impunity and illicit power. He further discusses the adaptation that enabled those nations’ militaries to turn defeat into victory, and the cost of that adaptation to international reputation and support.

Tabletop or Small Group Exercise. A tabletop exercise is a proven method of engaging participants and adaptive, creative thinking and teamwork. Module 7 provides options for facilitating a scenario-based tabletop or small group exercise. The purpose of this module is to encourage additional critical thinking, initiative, and teamwork while at the same time reinforcing the overall learning objectives.

Facilitator’s Guides, Lecture Notes, and Thematic Papers. These products are intended to highlight niche issues or recurring themes contained the modules within the model curriculum. The following is a complete list of all these products available as part of the “Countering Illicit Power” courseware:

- Facilitator’s Guides:
  - “Illicit Power Structures: An Introduction”
  - “It Takes a Thief to Catch a Thief: Understanding the Operational Environment”
  - “Criminal Patronage Networks and the Struggle to Rebuild the Afghan State”
  - “Traffickers and Truckers: Illicit Afghan and Pakistani Power Structures with a Shadowy but Influential Role”
  - “Sierra Leone: The Revolutionary United Front”
  - “Capacity Building, Institutional Development, and Accountability”
  - “Iraq: Muqtada al-Sadr and the Jaish al-Mahdi”
- “Liberia’s Legacy of Illicit Power: Collapse, Conflict and the Continuing Transformation of a Regime”
- “Make It Matter: Institutional Development That Works”

- Lecture Notes:
  - “Security Sector Reconstruction in Post-Conflict: The Lessons from Timor-Leste”
  - “Weapons Trafficking and the Odessa Network: How One Small Think Tank was Able to Unpack One Very Big Problem, and the Lessons It Teaches Us”
  - “Leviathan Redux: Toward a Community of Effective States”

**e-Guide to Countering Illicit Power in Humanitarian Assistance and Disaster Relief Operations.** This online pamphlet consists, in outline form, of planning considerations for HADR operations. It is a useful training aid for tabletop exercises and facilitated discussion of special considerations relating to illicit power that are often overlooked.
Module 1: Introduction to Illicit Power and the Problem of Convergence – Definitions, Objectives, and Taxonomy

Module 1 provides an orientation to the problem. It does so by introducing the concepts of “Convergence” and “Illicit Power,” the implications for national sovereignty and security, and overarching insights from the totality of the research.

Recommended Readings:

  - Forward by LTG H.R. McMaster
  - Introduction, by Michael Miklaucic
  - Chapter 10, “It Takes a Thief to Catch a Thief” by Michelle Hughes

  - Introduction by Michael Miklaucic and Jacqueline Brewer

Webcasts/Podcasts:

- Webcast: “Convergence, Beyond Convergence, and the Challenge of Impunity” featuring Michael Miklaucic

- Podcast: “Impunity: Countering Illicit Power in War and Transition – A Conversation with the Authors”

- Webcast: “Convergence in Criminalized States” featuring Douglas Farah

Lecture Notes and Facilitator’s Guides:


- Facilitator’s Guide: “It Takes a Thief to Catch a Thief: Understanding the Operational Environment”

Slide Pack: “Countering Illicit Power: How Do We Get It Right?”
Module 2: Peace Matters: The Impact of Peace Agreements and Political Accords on Illicit Power – Why is this an operational problem?

By comparing case studies from Afghanistan and Sierra Leone, and including a prospective look at Colombia, this module highlights one of the enduring insights from Impunity – that peace agreements and political settlements directly impact our ability to contain the rise of illicit power in a post-conflict environment. A critical learning objective is to create a bridge between policy and implementation. Discussions should center around the impact of peace agreements on every level of operations, how such strategic accords fit in the analysis of the operational environment, and how implementers can identify the ways in which agreements and settlements themselves create risk.

During beta testing of the model syllabus, this module proved to be the most popular among JPME students as it was the least well-understood prior to instruction.

Recommended Readings:

  - Chapter 1, “Criminal Patronage Networks in Afghanistan” by Carl Forsberg and Tim Sullivan
  - Chapter 5, “Traffickers and Truckers: Illicit Afghan and Pakistani Power Structures with a Shadowy but Influential Role” by Gretchen Peters
  - Chapter 8, “Sierra Leone: The Revolutionary United Front” by Ismail Rashid
  - Optional Recommended Reading: Chapter 6, “Colombia and the FARC: From Military Victory to Ambivalent Political Reintegration?” by Carlos Ospina


- Optional Recommended Viewing: BBC “Our World” Documentary: “Liberia and Sierra Leone – Dancing with the Devil” (Can be accessed on several sites via internet)

Webcasts/Podcasts:

- Webcast: “‘Sacred Documents’ and the Enemies of Peace: Why Agreements Matter” featuring Michelle Hughes
Lecture Notes and Facilitator’s Guides:

- Facilitator’s Guide: “Criminal Patronage Networks and the Struggle to Rebuild the Afghan State”
- Facilitator’s Guide: “Sierra Leone: The Revolutionary United Front”

Slide Pack: “Illicit Power Structures and Peace Agreements”
Module 3: Understanding the Operational Environment and the Intelligence Challenge

This module addresses another of the enduring insights from Impunity – the persistent failure of the U.S. and its international partners to understand the operational environment in which illicit powers structures arise and thrive. Building on Module 1, Module 3 offers several frameworks for analysis, suggestions for how to adapt commonly used doctrinal frameworks, and case studies that illustrate the value of open source intelligence and publicly available information. Multiple case studies are available to facilitate wide-ranging discussion, but the module outline focuses on the Odessa Network in particular, as an example of end-to-end analysis.

Recommended Primary Readings:

  - Chapter 10, “It Takes a Thief to Catch a Thief” by Michelle Hughes
  - Chapter 11, “Weapons Trafficking and the Odessa Network: How one small think tank was able to unpack one very big problem, and the lessons it teaches us” by David E. A. Johnson

  - Chapter 5, “Fixers, Super Fixers, and shadow Facilitators: How Networks Connect” by Douglas Farah

Optional Readings (depending on class interest and instructor objectives)

  - Chapter 13, “Recruitment and Radicalization: The Role of Social Media and New Technology” by Maeghin Alarid

  - Chapter 7, “Hezbollah’s Criminal Networks: Useful Idiots, Henchmen, and Organized Criminal Facilitators” by Matthew Levitt
  - Chapter 19, “Virtually Illicit: The Use of Social Media in a Hyper-Connected World” by Tuesday Reitano and Andrew Trabulsy
Webcasts/Podcasts:

- Webcast: “Traffickers and Truckers” featuring Gretchen Peters
- Webcast: “Radicalization, Social Media, and Gender” featuring Maeghin Alarid

Lecture Notes and Facilitator’s Guides:

- Lecture Notes: “Weapons Trafficking and the Odessa Network: How One Small Think Tank was Able to Unpack One Very Big Problem, and the Lessons It Teaches Us”
- Facilitator’s Guide: “It Takes a Thief to Catch a Thief: Understanding the Operational Environment”

Slide Pack: “Understanding the Operational Environment and the Intelligence Challenge”
Module 4: Capacity Building, Institutional Development, and Accountability

Module 4 focuses on capacity building, to include security sector reform and security sector governance, and look at the enduring lessons from both US and international security assistance efforts around the world. Discussions should cover overlooked challenges in effective monitoring and evaluation of capacity, and include consideration of enduring insights from both pre- and post-conflict stabilization; capacity building issues and planning for accountability and anti-corruption.

  - Chapter 14, “Leviathan Redux: Toward and Community of Effective States” by Claire Lockhart and Michael Miklaucic

  - Chapter 16, “Security Sector Reconstruction in Post Conflict: Lessons from Timor Leste” by Deniz Kozak
  - Chapter 14, “Make It Matter: Ten Rules for Institutional Development That Works” by Mark Kroeker
  - Chapter 17, “A Granular Approach to Combating Corruption and Illicit Power Structures” by Scott Carlson


- *PPD 23: U.S. Security Sector Assistance Policy [Fact Sheet]* (The White House, Office of the Press Secretary, April 5, 2013) [https://www.hSDL.org/?view&did=747214](https://www.hSDL.org/?view&did=747214)

Webcasts/Podcasts:

- Webcast: “The Problem of Police” featuring Michelle Hughes

Lecture Notes and Facilitator’s Guides:

- Lecture Notes: “Leviathan Redux: Toward and Community of Effective States”
- Lecture Notes: “Security Sector Reconstruction in Post-Conflict: The Lessons from Timor-Leste”

Slide Pack: “Capacity Building, Institutional Development, and Accountability”
Module 5: Countering Illicit Power in Humanitarian Assistance and Disaster Relief Operations

Module 5 is not a traditional teaching module in the sense that the others are but it can easily be adapted to become one. It consists of an e-guide to countering illicit power in HADR operations and its utility as a planning and implementation template. The e-guide was developed as a distance learning tool that can be converted to a platform lecture, panel presentation, or used as a checklist in scenario based, HADR tabletop exercises. For professors who wish to expand this topic, related supporting materials include:

  - Chapter 3 “Haiti: The Gangs of Cité” by D.C. (David) Beer

- Podcast: “The Challenge of Countering Impunity in International Missions” featuring Mark Kroeker and David Beer
Module 6: Planning and Prioritization

The purpose of Module 6 is to provide students with additional readings and perspectives that knit together the themes and lessons from the previous five modules. This is not a structured lecture, but rather an opportunity to reflect on lessons learned and their implications for future operations.

The focus of Module 6 is on defining strategic success and failure, and understanding how different operational lines of effort contribute sustainable control of illicit power within the host nation context. The concluding chapter of Impunity highlights the enduring lessons from the totality of the case studies and research. Chapter 15, “The Hitchhiker’s Guide to Intelligence-Led Policing” highlights a common operational challenge – the transition from operations under the Law of Armed Conflict, to evidence-based operations under domestic criminal statutes. The selected readings from beyond convergence challenge the students to look at the implications of the failure to contain convergence. The Haiti case study provides an excellent example of the complexities of international planning.

During beta tests of the curriculum, Module 6 created an important opportunity for students to air their uncertainties about the concepts, and to reflect on their own experience and exchange lessons and observations. For these reasons, there is no slide pack or Facilitator’s Guide.

  - Conclusion, “What Should We Have Learned by Now?” by Michelle Hughes
  - Chapter 3 “Haiti: The Gangs of Cité Soleil” by D.C. (David) Beer
  - Chapter 15, “The Hitchhiker’s Guide to Intelligence-Led Policing” by Clifford Aims

  - Introduction by Michael Miklaucic

  - Chapter 6, “Terrorist and Criminal Dynamics: A Look Beyond the Horizon” by Christopher Dishman
  - Chapter 8, “Convergence in Criminalized States: The New Paradigm” by Douglas Farah

Webcasts/Podcasts:

- Webcast: “Defining ‘Success’” featuring Thomas Marks
- Podcast: “The Challenge of Countering Impunity in International Missions” featuring Mark Kroeker and David Beer
Module 7: Applied Learning

During the test and evaluation process, all formats, except for the one-day seminar, concluded with an applied learning exercise that reinforced the concepts and learning that had taken place. Ultimately, two options proved to be the most effective.

Option 1: In classroom settings where the students were being graded, or where there was a research and writing requirement necessary for certification, a written project was assigned. This was done in a group, whereby students, working in teams of 3-4 persons, were required to develop a campaign or program design, to address the problem of impunity using one of the case studies that had not been emphasized during classroom instruction. Options included, for example, Liberia, Iraq, Haiti, Sri Lanka, Colombia, and the Philippines. Taking a historical perspective, students applied the taxonomy to analyze the illicit power structures. They conducted their own vulnerability analysis using the background materials provided in the book, identified critical intelligence and information requirements, and developed a campaign design to counter them that addressed both the lessons identified in those case studies and the enduring lessons from all the case studies. Groups then presented their analysis in both oral presentations and a written paper, essentially re-litigating the case.

In addition to the materials in Convergence and Impunity, the students were encouraged to use doctrinal templates so as to illustrate their adaptability. The quality of the written product was generally high. Feedback from the students indicated that the group interaction introduced myriad perspectives, particularly in classes that included interagency or Reserve component personnel who brought their civilian professional perspectives to bear. The advantage to this approach is that it does not require significant outside research. Although students did some, their main focus was on analyzing the material that was already presented in the books.

Option 2: A variation on Option 1 is to use current, real-world problems as the basis for analysis rather than a historical case. In testing, this approach worked particularly well in classes that had non-U.S. participants. It was also used in one interagency course that had been specifically designed to find solutions to a U.S. government strategic challenge involving illicit power. Using the Option 2 approach, students, again working in small groups, selected or were assigned a current problem set, and then proceeded to design a program or project to address the threat from illicit power. To avoid turning this into a research project, it was essential that at least one person in the group be expert on the problem.

Notable examples of resulting projects included one group’s plan to build capacity in Cote d’Ivoire to ensure free and fair elections in 2020. To be successful, they concluded that they had to address two known illicit power structures – criminal patronage networks and militias – that had upset the prior electoral process. Another group looked at the problem of accountability within the defense sector in Ukraine. A third focused on criminality within the Indonesian Coast Guard and its impact on the ability to control weapons trafficking and the spread of extremism via the maritime domain. In each instance, there was a member of the team that had personal experience and insight into the
problem set. However, the application of *Convergence* and *Impunity* lessons changed the way in which they analyzed the power structures, and assessed both risks and solutions. Option 2 did not require a written product, only a group presentation.

A core component of both options was the peer review that took place when projects were presented. Students were not allowed to “opt out” of participating in peer reviews. Every student was required to comment or question each presentation. Thus, the level of learning that went on during the peer reviews was extraordinary. The feedback from all participants was that this changed the way they would plan in the future – they were identifying opportunities and challenges that had never occurred to them before.
Additional Resources:


